

1

2

NEW YORK CITY TEACHERS' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

3

BOARD MEETING

4

5

6

Held on Thursday, March 19, 2020 via

7

Videoconference

8

9

ATTENDEES:

10

DEBRA PENNY, Chairperson, Trustee

11

DAVID KAZANSKY, Trustee

12

THOMAS BROWN, Trustee

13

JOHN ADLER, Trustee

14

SUSANNAH VICKERS, Trustee

15

NATALIE GREEN-GILES, Trustee

16

RUSSELL BUCKLEY, Trustee

17

CYNTHIA COLLINS, Mayor's Office

18

VALERIE BUDZIK, Teachers' Retirement System

19

PATRICIA REILLY, Teachers' Retirement System

20

21

REPORTED BY:

22

YAFFA KAPLAN

23

JOB NO. 4467580

24

25

1

2 ATTENDEES (Continued):

3 THAD McTIGUE, Teachers' Retirement System

4 ANNETTE HANHARAN, Teachers' Retirement System

5 LIZ SANCHEZ, Teachers' Retirement System

6 ISAAC GLOVINSKY, Teachers' Retirement System

7 BRYAN BERGE, ESQ., Law Department

8 MARTA ROSS, ESQ. Law Department

9 JASMINE GEORGES-YILLA, Law Department

10 SHERRY CHAN, Office of the Actuary

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 Proceedings

2 MS. REILLY: Good afternoon. Welcome to  
3 the March 19, 2020 TRS board meeting. I am  
4 going to start by calling the roll.

5 John Adler?

6 MR. ADLER: I am here.

7 MS. REILLY: Thomas Brown?

8 MR. BROWN: I am here.

9 MS. REILLY: Natalie Green-Giles?

10 MS. GREEN-GILES: I am here as well.

11 MS. REILLY: David Kazansky?

12 MR. KAZANSKY: Present.

13 MS. REILLY: Russell Buckley?

14 MR. BUCKLEY: Here for Lindsey Oates,

15 DOE CFO.

16 MS. REILLY: Debra Penny?

17 MS. PENNY: Here.

18 MS. REILLY: Susannah Vickers?

19 MS. VICKERS: Here.

20 MS. REILLY: We have a quorum. So next  
21 on the agenda is a report from the actuary. I  
22 will turn it over to Sherry.

23 MS. CHAN: Thank you, Patricia.

24 Hopefully everybody can hear me. If not I  
25 guess wave.

1 Proceedings

2 So the first item on my agenda is the  
3 preliminary contributions for the next fiscal  
4 year that starts in about three months. The  
5 contribution calculator for the next fiscal  
6 year is approximately 3.5 billion dollars.  
7 This does represent a decrease in  
8 contributions of about 234 million. This was  
9 due to the item that I had discussed  
10 previously at a previous board meeting  
11 concerning the change in the valuation  
12 methodology for the TDA actual valuation  
13 method. So there is a resolution in the back  
14 of my memo that I request the Board to take a  
15 look at, and I will be happy to answer any  
16 questions that anybody might have. Okay?

17 MR. KAZANSKY: No questions.

18 MS. CHAN: I will go on to the next  
19 question, which is Chapter 41 of the Laws of  
20 2016. Just a reminder to everybody, this law  
21 was passed in 2016, and it allows members to  
22 purchase their past military service  
23 regardless of when or where the military  
24 service was performed, and employees and  
25 members can purchase up to three years and

1 Proceedings

2 they pay a portion of it as well as the  
3 retirement system and the employer will pay --  
4 mostly the City in this case will pay the  
5 remainder.

6 So for Fiscal Year '19, which is what  
7 part of this calculation is for -- there were  
8 25 employees that purchased service for a  
9 total of 42 years. After deducting out the  
10 members' cost, the amount was 668,000 dollars.  
11 This represents the amount that the City  
12 already has paid or the employer already has  
13 paid into TRS, and this resolution is for  
14 directing the executive director of TRS to go  
15 to the State to ask for this reimbursement  
16 amount.

17 So just to give you guys some additional  
18 numbers also since 2016, which was when this  
19 law was passed, cumulatively this represents 5  
20 million dollars that the employers have paid  
21 into TRS already for this purchase of service  
22 that we are waiting for the State to  
23 reimburse. I will just see if there are any  
24 questions from anybody.

25 Hearing none, I will move on to my last

1                                Proceedings

2                agenda item for public session, which is the  
3                fiscal note report. There was one fiscal note  
4                that was issued since the last time that we  
5                met. This one fiscal note has to do with  
6                being able to also purchase military service  
7                for those other than those honorably  
8                discharged and this because we do not have the  
9                data for Chapter 41 purchases of the benchmark  
10              to see how many people would purchase their  
11              service if allowed, so we calculated this on a  
12              per-person basis just to give those reading  
13              the bill an idea if this list passed how much  
14              it would cost.

15              The contributions were calculated to be  
16              approximately 5,100 dollars for each member  
17              that purchased service, but the years of  
18              service that was assumed was 2.5 years. The  
19              past data Chapter 41 we did see approximately  
20              two and a half years being purchased by each  
21              member, so the 5,100 dollars represents a  
22              per-person basis based on if they purchase two  
23              and a half years, and that's a  
24              contribution-dollar basis. So if there are no  
25              questions, that's the end of my report.

1 Proceedings

2 MS. REILLY: Okay. Thank you, Sherry.  
3 Next on the agenda is the executive director's  
4 report, and the first item on there is that  
5 it's been suggested that the next regular  
6 meeting of the Teachers' Retirement Board be  
7 held on the third Monday of the month, April  
8 20, 2020. So please mark your calendars.

9 The second item is a resolution, the  
10 Actuary's determination for the Preliminary  
11 Fiscal Year 2021 Employer Contribution to the  
12 Teachers' Retirement System of the City of New  
13 York.

14 MR. KAZANSKY: Please skip to the  
15 resolved.

16 MS. REILLY: "Resolved, that the Board  
17 of Trustees hereby approves a Preliminary  
18 Fiscal Year 2021 Employer Contribution to the  
19 Teachers' Retirement System of the City of New  
20 York in the amount of 3,495,921,761 dollars."

21 Do we have any discussion? Do I have a  
22 motion for the Actuary's Determination for the  
23 Preliminary Fiscal Year 2021 Employer  
24 Contribution for the Teachers' Retirement  
25 System of the City of New York?

1 Proceedings

2 MR. BROWN: Tom Brown, so moved.

3 MR. KAZANSKY: David Kazansky, second.

4 MS. REILLY: All those in favor?

5 MR. ADLER: Aye.

6 MR. BROWN: Aye.

7 MS. GREEN-GILES: Aye.

8 MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.

9 MR. BUCKLEY: Aye.

10 MS. PENNY: Aye.

11 MS. VICKERS: Aye.

12 MS. REILLY: Any abstentions? Any --

13 okay. The motion passes I believe. And any

14 other abstentions and -- all right.

15 So the next resolution is the New York  
16 City Office of the Actuary's Fiscal Year 2019  
17 Reimbursement Calculation resulting from  
18 Chapter 41 of the Laws of 2016.

19 MR. KAZANSKY: Please skip to the  
20 resolved.

21 MS. REILLY: "Resolved, that the TRS  
22 Board of Trustees approves a voucher in the  
23 amount of 668,377 dollars for Fiscal Year 2019  
24 to be submitted to the State Comptroller for  
25 audit warrant and payment to TRS as



1 Proceedings

2 reimbursement for carrying out the provisions  
3 of Chapter 41."

4 Do I have a motion for the New York City  
5 Office of the Actuary's Fiscal Year 2019  
6 Reimbursement Calculations resulting from  
7 Chapter 41 of the Laws of 2016?

8 MS. PENNY: So moved.

9 MS. VICKERS: Second.

10 MS. REILLY: Okay. Is there any  
11 discussion? All those in favor, say aye.

12 MR. ADLER: Aye.

13 MR. BROWN: Aye.

14 MS. GREEN-GILES: Aye.

15 MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.

16 MR. BUCKLEY: Aye.

17 MS. PENNY: Aye.

18 MS. VICKERS: Aye.

19 MS. REILLY: Abstentions? Anybody  
20 opposed? Okay. The motion carries. The next  
21 item on the Executive Director's report is the  
22 CWA union increases for TRS employees.

23 MR. KAZANSKY: Please skip to the  
24 resolved.

25 MS. REILLY: "Resolved, that the

1 Proceedings

2 Trustees of the Teachers' Retirement Board  
3 hereby approve a modification of the Fiscal  
4 Year 2020 budget by increasing such budget in  
5 the amount of 85,101 dollars to cover  
6 contractual increases for Fiscal Year 2018 and  
7 Fiscal Year 2019 for all eligible staff under  
8 the CWA bargaining agreement."

9 Do I hear a motion for the CWA union  
10 increases for TRS employees?

11 MR. ADLER: John Adler, so moved.

12 MS. REILLY: Do I have a second?

13 MS. GREEN-GILES: Second.

14 MS. REILLY: Is there any discussion?

15 So all those in favor, say aye.

16 MR. ADLER: Aye.

17 MR. BROWN: Aye.

18 MS. GREEN-GILES: Aye.

19 MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.

20 MR. BUCKLEY: Aye.

21 MS. PENNY: Aye.

22 MS. VICKERS: Aye.

23 MS. REILLY: Any abstentions? All those  
24 opposed, say nay. The reso passes.

25 The next is a resolution for the

1 Proceedings

2 authorization to the Comptroller of the City  
3 of New York to invest certain QPP funds.

4 MR. KAZANSKY: Please waive the reading.

5 MS. REILLY: Do I have a motion for the  
6 authorization to the Comptroller of the City  
7 of New York to invest certain QPP funds?

8 MR. BROWN: So moved, Tom Brown.

9 MS. REILLY: Second?

10 MS. PENNY: Second, Debra Penny.

11 MS. REILLY: Any discussion? All those  
12 in favor, say aye.

13 MR. ADLER: Aye.

14 MR. BROWN: Aye.

15 MS. GREEN-GILES: Aye.

16 MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.

17 MR. BUCKLEY: Aye.

18 MS. PENNY: Aye.

19 MS. VICKERS: Aye.

20 MS. REILLY: Any abstentions? Any  
21 opposed? The motion carries.

22 Next is the authorization of the  
23 Comptroller of the City of New York to invest  
24 certain Tax-Deferred Annuity Funds.

25 MR. KAZANSKY: Please waive the reading.

1 Proceedings

2 MS. REILLY: Okay. Do I have a motion  
3 for the authorization to the Comptroller of  
4 the City of New York to invest certain  
5 Tax-Deferred Annuity Funds?

6 MR. BROWN: So moved, Tom Brown.

7 MS. REILLY: Second?

8 MS. PENNY: Second, Debra Penny.

9 MS. REILLY: Any discussion? All those  
10 in favor, please say aye.

11 MR. ADLER: Aye.

12 MR. BROWN: Aye.

13 MS. GREEN-GILES: Aye.

14 MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.

15 MR. BUCKLEY: Aye.

16 MS. PENNY: Aye.

17 MS. VICKERS: Aye.

18 MS. REILLY: All those opposed, say nay.

19 The motion passes.

20 So next on the agenda is the calendar.  
21 Let me just pull my calendar up. Hope I have  
22 it. Just give me a second. Okay. So the  
23 first item on the calendar is the matter of  
24 the approval of the minutes for the month of  
25 February 6th investment meeting minutes,

1

## Proceedings

2

February 26th CIM, and the 27th board minutes.

3

MR. ADLER: Just a note that the

4

February 6th minutes, the distinguished

5

representative of the chief financial officer

6

of the Department of Education is referred to

7

as Russ Bucko.

8

MR. McTIGUE: I think we are going to

9

lay those over to look at those.

10

MR. ADLER: In general, the February

11

6th --

12

MR. McTIGUE: They need some work.

13

MS. GREEN-GILES: In the CIM minutes,

14

there was a reference to a TRS trustee,

15

Patrick something, if anybody caught that.

16

MS. REILLY: So we are going to lay over

17

the February 6th investment meeting minutes.

18

Do I have approval to approve the February

19

26th CIM minutes and the February 27th board

20

meeting minutes?

21

MS. GREEN-GILES: The error I just

22

referred to is from the February 26th CIM, so

23

that might need another look as well.

24

MS. REILLY: How about the February 27th

25

board meeting minutes? Do I have a motion to

1 Proceedings

2 approve those minutes?

3 MR. BROWN: So moved, Tom Brown.

4 MS. VICKERS: Second, Susannah Vickers.

5 MS. REILLY: So all those in favor of

6 the approval of the February 27th board

7 meeting minutes, please say aye.

8 MR. ADLER: Aye.

9 MR. BROWN: Aye.

10 MS. GREEN-GILES: Aye.

11 MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.

12 MR. BUCKLEY: Aye.

13 MS. PENNY: Aye.

14 MS. VICKERS: Aye.

15 MS. REILLY: Any abstentions? Any

16 opposed? Okay. So we will approve the

17 February 27th board meeting minutes. February

18 6th and February 26th were laid over.

19 Valerie, do I need a motion to lay them

20 over?

21 MS. BUDZIK: No, I don't think you need

22 a motion to lay them over. They are just not

23 approved. So --

24 MS. REILLY: So next, the items on the

25 calendar. You all received the calendar.

1 Proceedings

2 MR. KAZANSKY: Please waive the reading  
3 of the calendar.

4 MS. REILLY: Thank you. All those in  
5 favor of approving the calendar, please say  
6 aye.

7 MR. ADLER: Wait. We need a motion.

8 MS. REILLY: Is there a motion to  
9 approve the calendar?

10 MS. PENNY: So moved.

11 MR. BROWN: Second, Tom Brown.

12 MS. REILLY: Any discussion of the  
13 calendar? Okay. All those in favor, please  
14 say aye.

15 MR. ADLER: Aye.

16 MR. BROWN: Aye.

17 MS. GREEN-GILES: Aye.

18 MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.

19 MR. BUCKLEY: Aye.

20 MS. PENNY: Aye.

21 MS. VICKERS: Aye.

22 MS. REILLY: All those opposed, say nay.  
23 Okay so the calendar passes. Let me just get  
24 back to my agenda. Give me one second. I am  
25 toggling back and forth. Okay.

1 Proceedings

2 So next on the agenda is other business.  
3 There being none, can I have a motion to go  
4 into executive session to discuss a personnel  
5 issue?

6 MR. BROWN: Motion to go into executive  
7 session, Tom Brown.

8 MS. REILLY: Is there a second?

9 MS. VICKERS: Second, Susannah Vickers.

10 MS. REILLY: Okay. All those in favor  
11 of going into executive session, please say  
12 aye.

13 MR. ADLER: Aye.

14 MR. BROWN: Aye.

15 MS. GREEN-GILES: Aye.

16 MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.

17 MR. BUCKLEY: Aye.

18 MS. PENNY: Aye.

19 MS. VICKERS: Aye.

20 MS. REILLY: Any opposed? Okay.

21 So now we are in executive session.

22 (Whereupon, the meeting went into Executive Session.)

23 MS. REILLY: So do I have a motion to  
24 leave executive session?

25 MS. VICKERS: So moved.



1 Proceedings

2 MS. REILLY: Second?

3 MR. BROWN: Second, Tom Brown.

4 MS. REILLY: All those in favor of  
5 leaving executive session, please say aye.

6 MR. ADLER: Aye.

7 MR. BROWN: Aye.

8 MS. GREEN-GILES: Aye.

9 MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.

10 MR. BUCKLEY: Aye.

11 MS. PENNY: Aye.

12 MS. VICKERS: Aye.

13 MS. REILLY: Anybody opposed? All  
14 right? We are out of executive session, back  
15 in public session. Do I have a motion to  
16 leave public session? We are going to do a  
17 readback of what we discussed in executive  
18 session.

19 MR. McTIGUE: I can do that if you want.

20 So during the executive session,  
21 personnel matters were discussed with the  
22 board of trustees.

23 MS. REILLY: Thank you. Do we have a  
24 motion to adjourn public session?

25 MR. KAZANSKY: So moved.

1 Proceedings

2 MS. GREEN-GILES: Second, Natalie  
3 Green-Giles.

4 MS. REILLY: All those in favor of  
5 leaving public session, please say aye.

6 MR. ADLER: Aye.

7 MR. BROWN: Aye.

8 MS. GREEN-GILES: Aye.

9 MR. KAZANSKY: Aye.

10 MR. BUCKLEY: Aye.

11 MS. PENNY: Aye.

12 MS. VICKERS: Aye.

13 MS. REILLY: Any opposed? So now we are  
14 adjourned.

15 (Time noted: 4:07 p.m.)

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

## C E R T I F I C A T E

3

STATE OF NEW YORK )

4

: ss.

5

COUNTY OF QUEENS )

6

7

I, YAFFA KAPLAN, a Notary Public

8

within and for the State of New York, do

9

hereby certify that the foregoing record of

10

proceedings is a full and correct

11

transcript of the stenographic notes taken

12

by me therein.

13

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto

14

set my hand this 29th day of March, 2020.

15

16

17

18

---

YAFFA KAPLAN

19

20

21

22

23

24

25